

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE **Patent and Trademark Office**

Address: COMMISSIONER OF PATENTS AND TRADEMARKS Washington, D.C. 20231

| APPLICATION NO. | FILING DATE | FIRST NAMED | ATTO | ATTORNEY DOCKET NO. | | | |
|---------------------------------|-------------|--------------|------|---------------------|-------|--------------|--|
| 9/051,565 | 06/08/98 | SELDESLACHTS | | D | 98227 | | |
| - BACHMAN & LA | | IM22/0104 | ٦ | EXAMINER SHERRER, C | | | |
| 900 CHAPEL STREET SUITE 1201 | | | | ART UN | | PAPER NUMBER | |
| EW HAVEN CT | 06510-2802 | | | 1761 DATE MAIL | ED: | 14 | |
| | | | | | 01/ | 04/01 | |

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

Commissioner of Patents and Trademarks

Advisory Action

1.

Application No. 09/051,565

Applicant(s)

Seldeslachts

Examiner

Curtis E. Sherrer

Group Art Unit 1761

| ТН | E PER | RIOD F | OR RESPON | NSE: [chec | only a) or | b)] | | | | | | | | | |
|----------|-------------------|------------------------------|---|-------------------------------------|--------------------------------|-----------------------------|------------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------------|-------------------------|--------------------------|--|-----------------------|---------------|-----|
| | a) 🗌 | expire | s | _ months fron | the mailing | date of the | e final reje | ction. | | | | | | | |
| | b) 🗌 | expire is late rejecti | es either three m r. In no event, l ion. | nonths from the however, will th | mailing date e statutory po | of the fina eriod for th | al rejection ne respons | n, or on the se expire la | e mailing d ater than s | ate of thi ix month | is Advisor s from the | y Action, to detect the detect of the detect | whichever he final | | |
| | date or | which t | of time must be he response, the period of exter the date of the | ne petition, and | the fee have | been filed | is the dat If the fee | e of the re Anv exten | sponse an sion fee p | id also th ursuant f | ne date for to 37 CFF | the purp | oses of | | |
| X | Appel period | llant's E d for re | Brief is due to sponse set f | wo months f orth above, | rom the da whichever | te of the is later). | Notice See 37 | of Appea CFR 1. | al filed o 191(d) a | n nd 37 (| <u>Dec</u> CFR 1.1 | <u>21, 200</u> 92(a). | <u>00</u> (or \ | within any | |
| Ap bu | plicar t is N0 | nt's res OT dee | sponse to the med to place | e final rejecte the appli | ction, filed cation in c | on <u>D</u> onditio | <u>ec 21, 2</u> n for all | 0000 owance | has : | been | conside | ered wit | th the fo | llowing effe | ct, |
| X | The p | ropose | ed amendme | nt(s): | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | □ w | vill be e | ntered upon | filing of a N | otice of Ap | peal and | d an Ap _l | oeal Brie | f. | | | | | | |
| | X w | | be entered b | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | X | they | raise new iss | sues that wo | uld require | further | conside | ration ar | nd/or sea | arch. (S | See note | e below) |). | | |
| | X | • | raise the issu | | • | | | | | | | | | | |
| | X | issue | are not deen s for appeal. | • | | | | | | | | | | ing the | |
| | | | present addi | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | NC | | Applicants p | - | | | | | | tions fo | r which | anteced | dent bas | is has not | _ |
| | | | nt's response | | | | | | | | | | | | _ |
| | New | ly prop | osed or ame mely filed an | nded claims | | | | | | | _ would | be allo | wable if | submitted in | а |
| | sepa | rate, ti | mely filed an | nendment ca | ancelling th | ne non-a | llowable | claims. | | | | | | | |
| X | for a | | it, exhibit or r ce because: ed. | request for r | econsidera | ation has | been c | onsidere | d but do | es NO | T place | the appl | lication i | n condition | |
| | | | it or exhibit w | | considered | becaus | e it is no | t directe | d SOLEI | LY to is | sues wi | nich wer | re newly | raised by the | 9 |
| X | For p | ourpose | es of Appeal, | , the status | of the claim | ns is as f | follows (| see atta | ched wri | tten ex | planatio | n, if any | /) : | | |
| | | | wed: <i>None</i> | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| | | | ected to: No | | - | | | | | | | | | | |
| | Clair | ns reje | cted: <u>28, 32</u> | 2, 33, and 35 | | | | | | | | | | | _ |
| | The | propos | ed drawing o | correction fil | ed on | | | 🗆 | has [| has no | ot been | approve | ed by the | Examiner. | |
| П | Note | the at | tached Inforr | mation Discl | osure State | ement(s |), PTO-1 | 449, Pa | per No(s | i) | | _/ | | \mathcal{N} | |
| | Othe | | | | | | | | | | (| uh | | E. SHERREI | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | 11MIT 4764 | - |

Serial Number: 09/051,565

ADVISORY ACTION

Response to After Final Amendment

- Applicants' arguments of 012/21/00 have been reviewed but not found to be 1. persuasive. Specifically, Applicants first assert that the claims are not indefinite and that do not understand the meaning of the term "scope." The common meaning of this term is the extent or range of an activity or operation. For example, with reference to the claim phrase "substantially preventing foam," the scope, i.e., the range of foam prevention is unknown.
- With regards to the obviousness rejection, Applicants assert that the method and 2. device provide for unexpected results whereby the use of internal appliances provide for satisfactory elimination of DMS with a very low steam to wort ratio. Applicants further state that "by providing these elements [] and performing the method claimed" certain benefits result. It appears that Applicants agree that the benefits are only derived through the use of the process and that the apparatus itself does not obtain these benefits if operated in a different manner. Therefore, the apparatus is not found patentable in light of Applicants' assertions of unexpected results.
- Because the proposed claims are not being entered, the arguments and the showing in 3. the declaration are not considered commensurate in scope with the instantly claimed invention.
- Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Curtis Sherrer whose telephone number is (703) 308-3847.

Serial Number: 09/051,565

The examiner can normally be reached on Tuesday through Friday from 6:30 to 4:30. The fax phone number for this Group is (703)-305-3602.

5. Any inquiry of a general nature or relating to the status of this application should be directed to the Group receptionist whose telephone number is (703) 308-0651.

Curtis E. Sherrer Primary Examiner January 2, 2001